

PLANNING COMMISSION

JANUARY 31, 2019

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Craig Pickerel. Commission members present were Greg Bade, Andy Lorenz, Mayor Mackin, Craig Pickerel, and John Wellstein (5). Also present was Brody Walters, Planning and Zoning Administrator, Mark Easterling, Deputy Planning and Zoning Administrator, and Laura Alkire, Law Director.

Election of Chairman and Vice-Chairman

Mr. Wellstein nominated Mr. Pickerel to be Chairman. Seconded by Mr. Lorenz.
Ayes: (5). Nays: (0).

Mr. Lorenz nominated Mr. Wellstein to be Vice-Chairman. Seconded by Mayor Mackin.
Ayes: (5). Nays: (0).

Approval of Minutes

Mayor Mackin moved to approve the minutes of the December 13, 2018 meeting as written. Seconded by Mr. Wellstein. Ayes: Mackin, Pickerel, and Wellstein (3). Nays: (0). Abstain: Bade and Lorenz (1).

Administrator's Report

No report.

Preliminary & Final Site Plan Swig (Awning Addition) 219 Louisiana Avenue

APPLICANT

Jim Hodulik
219 Louisiana Ave.
Perrysburg, OH 43551
419-787-3358

REQUEST

Chapter 1260.05 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1260.08 – Final Site Plan Review
Chapter 1250 – Site Design Standards

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

The subject property is located at 219 Louisiana Avenue. The property is on the east side of Louisiana Avenue, just south of the alley way, in between Second Street and Third Street. The property in question is zoned C-2 (Central Business) and currently houses the Swig restaurant on the first floor and residential space on the second floor. This property is completely surrounded by C-2 (Central Business) zoning districts.

ANALYSIS

Land Use – The current use of the property has been reviewed and determined to be “restaurant full service” and is therefore an approved use in the C-2 district.

Dimensional Standards – The C-2 zoning district does not have any setback requirement so this parcel is treated as a zero lot line property. The only dimensional requirement is that the building cannot exceed a height of 35 feet which is not an issue for this application.

Building Materials – The applicant’s building is composed of majority face brick, with the addition consisting of a fabric panel. Although the brick is an approved material up to 100%, the fabric paneling is not an approved material. However, the material was approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission, therefore giving the applicant relief from this section of the codified ordinance.

Access – The subject location is accessible from an alley just north of the building that intersects with Louisiana Avenue. As the building has direct access to public parking and the zoning district does not have a parking requirement, the current access is not proposed to change as part of this application.

Parking – The C-2 zoning district does not require on-site parking but the site does currently have access to public parking on the east and west sides of the building.

Parking Landscaping – Not applicable.

Site Landscaping – C-2 zoning does not have a minimum landscape percentage requirement therefore no landscape plan is necessary. The applicant does have approximately 180SF of landscaping long the northern edge of the property.

Street Trees – The frontage of the property is at 46.28 feet, and according to the formula listed in the Department of Public Service “Street Tree Brochure” there are no additional street trees needed.

Signage – There are no additional signs proposed in this application but any future sign changes will require review and approval by the Historic Landmarks Commission as well as the Planning and Zoning Division for the issuance of permits.

**Note: Relief for area, height and setback can be sought from the BZA. No relief can be provided for sign quantity.*

Lighting – No new light fixtures are shown.

Sidewalks – Sidewalks are shown across the frontage of the property.

Waste Receptacles – No exterior trash receptacle on-site.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Deputy Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission approve the Preliminary and Final Site Plan as submitted for Swig located at 219 Louisiana Avenue.

Mr. Easterling reviewed the above Staff Report. Jim Hodulik, Swig, and Tony Lockard, Marygrove Awnings were present. Mayor Mackin asked about new signage, and Mr. Hodulik confirmed that the current signage will stay. Mr. Hodulik stated that they are taking the old awning down, and covering the entire patio with the same material. He added that the east end will be completely solid, and that the north and front panels will be motorized with two access doors.

Mr. Wellstein moved to approve the Preliminary & Final Site Plan (Awning Addition) for Swig as submitted. Seconded by Mayor Mackin. Ayes: (5). Nays: (0).

Preliminary Plat Approval Summerfield Subdivision R-5 Lots

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

Steve Mitchell
Summerfield Perrysburg Development, Ltd.
3150 Republic Blvd. Suite 3
Toledo, OH 43615

Feller Finch and Associates, Inc.
1683 Woodlands Drive, P.O. Box 68
Maumee, Ohio 43537

REQUEST

Chapter 1295.01 – Preliminary Plat

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

The Summerfield Subdivision is located north of Five Point Road, west of SR25 and east of Fort Meigs Road. The entrance to the subdivision is located in the middle of Bay

Shore Village Plat 1. This application is only for a portion of the overall subdivision that is located along the eastern property line. The portion of the property that is the subject of this current request is approximately 17.157 acres in size.

BACKGROUND

The Summerfield Subdivision is located on the site of the former proposed Bay Shore Village Subdivision. When the property transferred ownership, the entire property was zoned R-4 (Single Family Residential). An application to the Planning Commission in March 2017 resulted in City Council ultimately approving an ordinance to rezone a piece of the property along the eastern property line to R-5 (Two Family Residential) to help provide a transition or buffer between the single family homes to the west and the potential non-residential uses to the east.

ANALYSIS

The City of Perrysburg's current Comprehensive Plan indicates "Encouraged Growth, Economic Development Area."

For R-5 zoned properties, Ch. 1230.01 of the code requires a minimum lot area of 10,000 SF with a minimum lot width of 90 feet.

Applicable setbacks for this property are as follows:

Front: 35'

Side: total of 16' (with the smallest not being less than 6')

Rear: 30'

Height: max 35'

Dwelling Size: min 600 SF

All proposed lots currently meet or exceed the minimum lot size as well as the minimum requirements for street frontage (65') and 90' at the building line.

The subject property shall be subject to Chapter 1295 – Subdivision Regulations.

Planning & Zoning:

General

- The Preliminary Plat indicates the developer intends to provide cash-in-lieu of open space. If the Planning Commission should choose to accept the cash option instead of the open space, the payment would be calculated at 7.5% of the appraised value of the land (pre-development value) plus \$100 per recorded lot in the final plat. The intent of this payment is to allow the city to either acquire additional recreational land or improve the existing facilities. In order to calculate the value of the land an appraisal dated within the last 5 years must be supplied.
- Crosswalks to be provided where blocks exceed 900 feet in length.

- Sidewalk should be installed at a width of 5 feet.
- Points of access to the lots is well done with 3 points of connection.

Preliminary Plat approval shall be effective for a maximum period of twenty-four (24) months unless, upon application of the developer, the Planning Commission grants an extension. If the Final Plat has not been recorded within this time limit, the Preliminary Plat must again be submitted to the Planning Commission for approval.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission approve the overall Preliminary Plat for the R-5 portion of the Summerfield Subdivision subject to the comments and recommendations in this report.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. Steve Mitchell, Summerfield Perrysburg Development, and Greg Feller, Feller Finch and Associates were present. Mr. Mitchell added that he agreed with the comments and recommendations in the report, except for the cross-walk-ways, where he asked for relief to be granted. Mr. Walters clarified that standard crosswalks with the truncated domes are to be provided on blocks that exceed 900 feet in length, and Mr. Mitchell added that he understands and agrees with the regulation. There were no further comments or questions from the commission, nor the public.

Mayor Mackin moved to approve the Preliminary Plat for Summerfield Subdivision R-5 (Two Family Residential) lots subject to the comments and recommendations in this report. Seconded by Mr. Lorenz. Ayes: (5). Nays: (0).

Preliminary Plat Approval Riverford Plat 11

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

Schroeder Company
4668 Talmadge Rd.
Toledo, Ohio

The JDI Group
360 W. Dussel Dr.
Maumee, OH 43537

REQUEST

Chapter 1295.01 – Preliminary Plat

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

The subject property is located south of SR64 along and is proposed to be a continuation of both Delaware Drive and Chippewa Lane to the north, within the existing Riverford Subdivision.

The proposed Plat 11 consists of 28 lots on approximately 16.907 acres. The land was recently rezoned from A-1 (Agricultural) to zoned R-3 (Single Family Residential).

BACKGROUND

Final Plat 1 was approved while still in Perrysburg Township prior to annexation. The remaining plats were approved per the following:

Plat 2: December 3, 1992

Plat 3: May 25, 1995

Plat 4: June 25, 1998

Plat 5: August 19, 2004

Plat 6: August 28, 2014

ANALYSIS

The Code provides for a minimum lot area of 11,600 SF for R-3 Zoning. All proposed lots currently meet or exceed the minimum lot size. Each lot is also in accordance with the dimensional requirements for depth and width.

The subject property shall be subject to Chapter 1295 – Subdivision Regulations.

Planning & Zoning:

General

- Open space has not been set aside for this subdivision so the developer is proposing cash in lieu of open space. The calculation for this fee will be calculated per the following formula: 7.5% of the appraised (predeveloped) value of the acreage + \$100 per lot included in the plat.
- 5 foot sidewalks are required throughout the plat.
- Rear yard catch basins will be required on every other lot. (This is a new requirement that will be reviewed upon the submission of construction plans). This requirement will likely result in additional side yard drainage easements being present upon the presentation of the final plat.

Preliminary Plat approval shall be effective for a maximum period of twenty-four (24) months unless, upon application of the developer, the Planning Commission

grants an extension. If the Final Plat has not been recorded within this time limit, the Preliminary Plat must again be submitted to the Planning Commission for approval.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission approve the overall Preliminary Plat for the Riverford Plat 11 subject to the comments and recommendations in this report.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. Ed Schroeder, Schroeder Company was present, and stated that he agrees with the conditions. Mr. Bade questioned the drainage for some of the lots based upon the topography. Sarah Szahradnik, JDI Group was also present on behalf of the application. Mr. Bade noted that the ravine will present a problem engineering-wise. He asked Mr. Schroeder why he didn't consider using the large ravine as a part of his open-space fee, in lieu of cash. Mr. Schroeder stated that he didn't think about it. Ms. Szahradnik confirmed that a portion of the ravine can be used as open-space. There were no further comments or questions from the commission, nor the public.

Mr. Lorenz moved to approve the Preliminary Plat for Riverford Plat 11 subject to the comments and recommendations in this report. Seconded by Mr. Bade. Ayes: Bade, Lorenz, Pickerel, and Wellstein (4). Nays: (0). Abstain: Mackin (1).

Preliminary & Final Site Plan Ohio CAT Power Systems Division & Peterbilt 13015 Eckel Junction Road

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

Mr. David Blocksom
Ohio CAT
3993 East Royalton Road
Broadview Heights, OH 44147

Mark Ricchiuto
Marous Brothers Construction
1702 Joseph Lloyd Parkway
Willoughby, OH 44094

Mark Smoley P.E. / Chris Copeland P.E.
Mannik Smith Group
23225 Mercantile Road
Beachwood, OH 44122

REQUEST

Chapter 1260.06 – Preliminary Site Plan Review

Chapter 1260.08 – Final Site Plan Review

Chapter 1250 – Site Design Standards

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

Location: This property is located on the south side of Eckel Junction Road, immediately east of the CSX rail line. Directly to the north is Tri-State Forest Products and directly to the east is Cutting Edge Countertops.

Property Size: 15.65 total acres

Parcels: Q61-100-130000004000 (portion), Q61-100-130000001000 and Q61-100-130000002000 (portion)

BACKGROUND

This property has been for sale for many years by property owner Mr. Robert Farley. On September 27, 2018 Ohio CAT representatives/agents appeared before the Planning Commission to request approval of a Preliminary Site Plan for the entirety of Mr. Farley's property as well as for the smaller City owned parcel located in the southwest corner of the project site. The City allowed Ohio CAT to proceed with the Preliminary Site Plan with the condition that any Final Site Plan approval be conditioned on the successful acquisition of the property from the City. The Preliminary Site Plan was reviewed by the Planning Commission and was subsequently approved with several conditions including securing any and all necessary variances, acquisition of the City owned property and several other more minor site plan details.

Also at the September meeting of the Planning Commission the rezoning of the property was recommended to City Council who ultimately did rezone the property from PBP (Planned Business Park) to I-2 (General Industrial).

ANALYSIS

This application is being reviewed as a new Preliminary and Final site plan application because the site plan has changed significantly since the original Preliminary Site Plan application was submitted and approved several months ago.

Preliminary Site Plan

- **Zoning:** I-2 (General Industrial)

- **Setbacks/Dimensional:** Front: 60 ft.
Side: 25 ft. (min. side)
Rear: 40 ft.
Lot Width: 100 ft.
Height (main building): 45 ft.
Coverage: 60% max building coverage
Landscape: 10% site (min.)
- **Adjacent Zoning/Uses:**
 - North** – I-2 General Industrial (Tri-State Forest), Johnstone Machinery Movers
 - East** – PBP Planned Business Park
 - South** – I-475/US 23
 - West** – CSX Rail Line, A-1 Agricultural, INS Institutional (YMCA), P Park (Rotary Park)
- **Land Use(s):** Agriculture, Construction, Semi-Truck Sales/Service (Permitted) Commercial Semi-Truck Sales/Service (Permitted), Warehousing (Permitted)
- **Site Layout:** The applicant proposes to construct a building to house Ohio CAT Power Systems Division and a Peterbilt truck dealership. The site plan indicates a 68,000 SF building and a 7,397 SF cold storage building.
- **Roads and Access:** The entrance drive to the site is aligned with the existing opposing drive on Eckel Junction Road to allow for future signalization if warranted. A trip generation study was prepared and submitted by the Mannik Smith Group and was reviewed by City staff. The contribution of traffic to the local area will result in a required intersection contribution of approximately \$98,000.00 (this fee covers both Ohio CAT project sites).
- **Parking:** The main building as shown provides 68 parking spaces. This use requires 5 parking spaces plus 1 for each employee during the largest shift. Based on this calculation only 47 would be required so the parking count has been satisfied. Additionally, parking is shown to be on at least 2 sides of the building and its perceived scale has been reduced through the use of a drive aisle and strategically designed landscape islands. All parking spaces are shown to be 10' x 20' in size and the smallest drive aisle is 24 feet wide.
- **Landscape Islands:** The site plan shows a detailed layout of landscape islands and the proposed plantings. All parking areas have met or exceeded the requirement for landscape islands but the planting plan does not meet the code requirement for shade trees within the islands. Approximately half of the landscape islands do not provide any shade trees and some of the landscape islands that do shows shade trees are not shown in the proper quantity. The code states that there should be 2 trees per landscape island and it has been

interpreted in the past that a 10' x 20' island is a "half island." Per Chapter 1250.10(b), all sites larger than ½ acre shall include irrigation.

- **Parking Lot Landscape:** The parking area of the site is to be landscaped at a minimum of 6 percent. Areas that are within or immediately adjacent to the parking lot can contribute to this percentage. Any areas within or adjacent to the parking lot cannot also be counted towards the 10 percent "site landscaping" requirement. The landscape architect has not included an identifiable calculation for the parking lot landscape percentage. While it does appear that the quantity of landscape would likely meet the requirement, the landscape within several islands does not include shade trees.
- **Site Landscape:** The overall site (the area of the site minus the parking lot area) is required to provide at least 10 percent of its area as intentional landscape. Turf grass is not considered intentional landscape. The site plan document indicates that 10 percent landscaping has been provided as does the landscape sheets that have been provided by the Registered Landscape Architect.
- **Sidewalks:** Public sidewalks are shown across all frontages and through the entrance drive. Additionally, the site plan provides for pedestrian sidewalk access to the buildings main entrances.
- **Curb Cuts & Driveways:** The proposed site plan shows 1 point of access to Eckel Junction Road from this location although there is a drive lane connecting to the property to the west that would allow access to Eckel Junction Road from that property's access also. The location of drives is consistent with the City's requirements for alignment, site distance and proximity to existing drives.
- **Lighting:** A lighting plan has been provided indicating compliance with on-site lighting requirements and light "spillage". I-2 zoning permits light fixtures to be 35 feet high and the tallest fixtures on this site are 30 feet in height.
- **Building Materials:** The building is primarily constructed of metal panels, some glass/glazing and some faced brick. The architect has not provided a building material percentage calculation and without this it is difficult to determine whether the building as proposed meets the percentage requirements. It appears that the use of metal panels would exceed the allowable 75 percent. Due to the size of the building and numerous "match lines" on the provided plans it is recommended to require a material percentage calculation be supplied.
- **Building Design:** The applicants have provided building elevation sheets for all sides of the building. Due to the length and overall size of the building the requirements of Ch. 1250.481 (a) – (h) shall also be considered. On large buildings such as this the code requires that various recesses and projects be incorporated into the buildings design to provide for visual interest and to reduce

the overall perceived scale of the building. The following are the specific requirements related to building design.

- (a) All facades of a principal building that directly face an abutting public street shall feature at least one customer entrance.
- (b) Facades greater than 100 feet in length shall incorporate recesses and projections a minimum of three feet in depth and a minimum of 20 contiguous feet within each 100 feet of facade length. Windows, awnings, entry areas, and arcades shall total at least sixty percent (60%) of the facade length facing a public street.
- (c) Smaller retail spaces that are part of a larger principal retail building shall be transparent between the height of three (3) feet and eight (8) feet above the walkway grade for no less than sixty (60) percent of the horizontal length of the building facade. Windows shall be recessed and should include visually prominent sills, shutters or such forms of framing. Smaller retail spaces shall have separate outside entrances.
- (d) Building facades shall include a repeating pattern that shall include no less than three of the following elements: color change, texture change, material module change, or expression of architectural or structural bay through a change in plane no less than twelve (12) inches in width, such as an offset, reveal, or projecting rib. At least one of these elements shall repeat horizontally. All elements shall repeat at intervals of no more than thirty (30) feet, either horizontally or vertically.
- (e) Roof lines shall provide variations to reduce the massive scale of these structures and to add visual interest. Roof lines shall have a change in height every 100 linear feet in the building length. Parapets, mansard roofs, gable roofs, hip roofs, or dormers shall be used to conceal flat roofs and roof top mechanical equipment from the public view.
- (f) Facade colors shall be of low reflectance, subtle, neutral or earth tone colors. The use of high intensity colors, metallic colors, black or fluorescent colors is prohibited.
- (g) Building trim may feature brighter colors than facade colors, but illuminated tubing is prohibited.
- (h) Each principle building or tenant space shall have a clearly defined, highly visible customer entrance with a minimum of three of the following features: canopies, porticos, overhangs, recesses/projections, arcades, raised cornice parapets over the door, peaked roof forms, outdoor patios, display windows, architectural details such as tile work and moldings which are integrated into the building structure and design, integral planters or wing walls that incorporate landscape areas and/or places for sitting.

- **Accessory Buildings:** The code allows for accessory buildings (defined as “A subordinate structure, located on the same lot as the principal building, the use of which is naturally or normally incidental to the principal use of the principal building or land.”) provided they meet the following requirements:
 - The combined footprints of all accessory buildings on a lot shall not exceed the lesser of 5 percent of the lot size or 4,000 SF. The BZA may consider an exception to the maximum size requirement providing that the requested size does not exceed 8 percent of the lot size.
 - Not be taller than 20 feet in height
 - Not be located closer than 10 feet to the principal structure
 - Adhere to the same building material requirement percentages as the principal structure
 - Be located in a rear yard
- **Fencing:** Fencing is permitted on this site at a height of four (4) feet. Six (6) foot fencing may be permitted if the BZA grants a variance. Additionally the use of chain-link fencing in a front yard is prohibited so the applicants have shown a decorative aluminum fence for the frontage along Eckel Junction Road. It is also important to note that barbed wire is not permitted anyone on this site.
- **General Engineering:** The applicant shall submit and obtain City of Perrysburg engineering approvals for site civil construction plans, including pavement and drainage, water, storm and sanitary sewer prior to a zoning permit being issued. Additionally, a pre-construction meeting must be conducted prior to the issuance of any zoning permit, and is required prior to Wood County issuing a building permit.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator has reviewed all necessary information for the consideration of the Preliminary and Final Site Plan and recommends approval of Final Site Plan with the following conditions:

1. Payment of intersection contribution fees.
2. Any and all variances be obtained by the Board of Zoning Appeals for accessory building size. The use of the accessory building cannot be considered a second principal building due to its clear and obvious subordinate role to the larger building.
3. Any and all variances be obtained by the Board of Zoning Appeals for fencing that exceeds four (4) feet height in the front yard.
4. The landscape plan must be revised to show shade trees in provided landscape islands.

5. Provide site irrigation for landscaped areas.
6. Provide landscape coverage percentage for the provided parking lot area(s) to verify compliance with 6 percent minimum.
7. Provide a building material percentage calculation to demonstrate compliance with the maximum percentage of metal siding.
8. The building materials of the accessory building need to be changed to comply with Ch. 1250.48 which would not permit 100 percent metal siding.
9. The north, east, and south elevation of the principal building will need to be modified to comply with Ch. 1250.481. This chapter would require a customer entrance and a more “street friendly view” on the north elevation with the same recesses and projections as were attempted on other portions of the building.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report, and noted that this is a new preliminary site plan due to significant changes for the two different sites at 13015 and 13017 Eckel Junction Road. Mark Ricchiuto, Mark Green, and Brian Gerrity, Marous Brothers Construction, Mark Smoley, Mannik Smith Group, and Brandon Hipp, Ohio CAT were present. Mr. Green reviewed a PowerPoint presentation to address the concerns on both 13015 and 13017 Eckel Junction Road. He added that they will be seeking relief from the BZA for the overall height of the Wash Bay (accessory building), as dropping below twenty (20) feet will not support their building operations. Mr. Wellstein confirmed that Ohio CAT is proposing that the Wash Bay be twenty-eight (28) feet tall. There was a brief discussion on considering the Wash Bay to be a second primary structure on the property. Mr. Smoley added that they could consider a lot split to accommodate the functionality of the Wash Bay. Mr. Green stated that they will be seeking BZA approval for a six (6) foot fence which will be ornamental in style, and confirmed that they will comply with the landscape requirement to plant shade trees in the parking lot islands. He said that they would prefer to be more sustainable on site with regards to irrigation, and are proposing irrigation landscaping along Eckel Junction Road and along the central drive area only. Mr. Bade offered his concern on the long-term landscaping care and cost, especially to the rear of the property, and Mr. Green noted that there will be heavy machinery equipment that will be staged on top of boulder sized mounds, so the site will be maintained and aesthetically pleasing. Mr. Green added that Ohio CAT will comply with the minimum requirement of six (6) percent (of the parking area) landscape coverage. There was a brief discussion about building materials, and Mr. Walters noted that the code requires that metal panels cannot exceed seventy-five (75) percent of the materials. Mr. Green stated that the Wash Bay and Cold Storage Building are both comprised of metal panels with protection walls. He said that Ohio CAT will comply with the building materials code requirement. Mr. Green added that Ohio CAT will comply and provide additional “façade breakups” for building elevations longer than one hundred (100) feet, much like the elevations at Schutz Container. He stated that Ohio CAT is requesting an exception to allow the “customer entrance” on the west elevation for functionality and operational purposes. There was a brief discussion about two-way

traffic on site, and the sixty (60) percent windows or storefront requirement along Eckel Junction Road. Mr. Gerrity stated that it will be a challenge for Ohio CAT to hit the window requirement, and Mayor Mackin asked how close they will be to the sixty (60) percent. Mr. Wellstein stated maybe twenty (20) percent, and Mr. Green agreed.

Once Mr. Green was finished with his PowerPoint presentation highlighting site compliance there was further discussion amongst the Commission. Mr. Bade asked that Ohio CAT consider more irrigation adjacent to the parking lots, and Mayor Mackin questioned measures taken in the past. Mr. Walters noted that the last exception made was with Saint John XXIII, as they agreed to self-maintenance with regards to the landscaping irrigation. He added that the code does not address one hundred (100) percent site compliance. There was a brief discussion amongst the Commission about extending the irrigation around the retention pond, and Mr. Green stated that Ohio CAT will provide a final plan to Mr. Walters for an administrative review. Next, the Commission discussed the building elevations that are required by code for 13015 Eckel Junction Road, and more specifically the “street friendly view”. Mr. Green noted that the front face of the buildings is about two hundred fifty (250) feet off of Eckel Junction Road, so the “street friendly view” will be heavily landscaped. Mr. Wellstein asked that Ohio CAT consider adding signage to break-up the “warehouse” look of the building at 13015 Eckel Junction Road. Mr. Walters added that at this point the Planning Commission may choose to grant approval of the Preliminary Site Plan, with an updated Final Site Plan to be reviewed at the February Planning Commission meeting. Or to provide conditional approval of the Preliminary and Final Site Plan, with an administrative review regarding the conditions that still need to be met. Mr. Pickerel asked if there will be roof top units, and if they will be screened, and Mr. Gerrity confirmed that those units will be screened appropriately.

Brian Burns, Cutting Edge Countertops asked about the parking lot materials, and if there will be gravel. Mr. Ricchuto said that the eastern property will be hard pavement, and he added that they made some significant changes material wise compared to their original Preliminary Site Plan request on October 25, 2018. There were no further comments or questions from the Commission, nor the public.

Mr. Bade moved to approve the Preliminary Site Plan, and to grant conditional approval with the conditions listed in this report, with an administrative review for the Final Site Plan for Ohio CAT at 13015 Eckel Junction Road. Seconded by Mr. Wellstein.
Ayes: (5). Nays: (0).

**Preliminary & Final Site Plan
Ohio CAT Rental & Heavy Equipment
13017 Eckel Junction Road**

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

Mr. David Blocksom
Ohio CAT

3993 East Royalton Road
Broadview Heights, OH 44147

Mark Ricchiuto
Marous Brothers Construction
1702 Joseph Lloyd Parkway
Willoughby, OH 44094

Mark Smoley P.E. / Chris Copeland P.E.
Mannik Smith Group
23225 Mercantile Road
Beachwood, OH 44122

REQUEST

Chapter 1260.06 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1260.08 – Final Site Plan Review
Chapter 1250 – Site Design Standards

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

Location: This property is located on the south side of Eckel Junction Road, immediately east of the CSX rail line. Directly to the north is Tri-State Forest Products and directly to the east is Cutting Edge Countertops.

Property Size: 23.74 total acres

Parcels: Q61-100-130000004000 (portion), Q61-100-130000003000, Q61-100-130000002000 (portion), Q61-100-130000008003 (currently City owned)

BACKGROUND

This property has been for sale for many years by property owner Mr. Robert Farley. On September 27, 2018 Ohio CAT representatives/agents appeared before the Planning Commission to request approval of a preliminary site plan for the entirety of Mr. Farley's property as well as for the smaller city owned parcel located in the southwest corner of the project site. The City allowed Ohio CAT to proceed with the Preliminary Site Plan with the condition that any Final Site Plan approval be conditioned on the successful acquisition of the property from the City. The Preliminary Site Plan was reviewed by the Planning Commission and was subsequently approved with several conditions including securing any and all necessary variances, acquisition of the City owned property and several other more minor site plan details.

Also at the September meeting of the Planning Commission the rezoning of the property was recommended to City Council who ultimately did rezone the property from PBP (Planned Business Park) to I-2 (General Industrial).

ANALYSIS

This application is being reviewed as a new Preliminary and Final Site Plan application because the site plan has changed significantly since the original Preliminary Site Plan application was submitted and approved several months ago.

Preliminary Site Plan

- **Zoning:** I-2 (General Industrial)
- **Setbacks/Dimensional:** Front: 60 ft.
Side: 25 ft. (min. side)
Rear: 40 ft.
Lot Width: 100 ft.
Height (main building): 45 ft.
Coverage: 60% max building coverage
Landscape: 10% site (min.)
- **Adjacent Zoning/Uses:**
 - North** – I-2 General Industrial (Tri-State Forest), Johnstone Machinery Movers
 - East** – PBP Planned Business Park
 - South** – I-475/US 23
 - West** – CSX Rail Line, A-1 Agricultural, INS Institutional (YMCA), P Park (Rotary Park)
- **Land Use(s):** Agriculture, Construction, Semi-Truck Sales/Service (Permitted)
Commercial Semi-Truck Sales/Service (Permitted), Warehousing (Permitted)
- **Site Layout:** The applicant proposes to construct a building to house Ohio CAT Rental & Heavy Equipment Divisions. The site plan indicates a 60,196 SF building and a 14,740 SF accessory building.
- **Roads and Access:** The entrance drive to the site is aligned with the existing opposing drive on Eckel Junction Road to allow for future signalization if warranted. A trip generation study prepared and submitted by the Mannik Smith Group and was reviewed by city staff. The contribution of traffic to the local area will result in a required intersection contribution of approximately \$98,000.00 (this fee covers both Ohio CAT project sites).
- **Parking:** The main building as shown provides 110 parking spaces. This use requires 5 parking spaces plus 1 for each employee during the largest shift. Based on this calculation only 53 would be required so the parking count has been satisfied. Additionally, parking is shown to be on at least 2 sides of the building and its perceived scale has been reduced through the use of a drive aisle and strategically designed landscape islands. All parking spaces are shown

to be 10' x 20' in size and the smallest drive aisle is 24 feet wide. As an additional note, there was a considerable amount of discussion during the September 2018 meeting of the Planning Commission regarding the use of a stone parking/storage surface. At the previous meeting the Planning Commission elected to make a distinction between a driveway/parking lot and a storage area, thereby allowing this unique stone surface to be used to store heavy tracked equipment on. Since the last meeting the area of the stone surfacing has been significantly decreased and now only occupies "necessary" areas.

- **Landscape Islands:** The site plan shows a detailed layout of landscape islands and the proposed plantings. All parking areas have met or exceeded the requirement for landscape islands but the planting plan does not meet the code requirement for shade trees within at least 4 of the islands. The code states that there should be 2 trees per landscape island and it has been interpreted in the past that a 10' x 20' island is a "half island." Per Chapter 1250.10(b), all landscaped areas over ½ acre in size shall include irrigation.
- **Parking Lot Landscape:** The parking area of the site is to be landscaped at a minimum of 6%. Areas that are within or immediately adjacent to the parking lot can contribute to this percentage. Any areas within or adjacent to the parking lot cannot also be counted towards the 10% "site landscaping" requirement. The landscape architect has not included an identifiable calculation for the parking lot landscape percentage. While it does appear that the quantity of landscape would likely meet the requirement the landscape within several islands does not include shade trees.
- **Site Landscape:** The overall site (the area of the site minus the parking lot area) is required to provide at least 10% of its area as intentional landscape. Turf grass is not considered intentional landscape. The site plan document indicates that 10% landscaping has been provided as does the landscape sheets that have been provided by the Registered Landscape Architect.
- **Sidewalks:** Public sidewalks are shown across all frontages and through the entrance drive. Additionally, the site plan provides for pedestrian sidewalk access to the buildings main entrances.
- **Curb Cuts & Driveways:** The proposed site plan shows 1 point of access to Eckel Junction Road from this location although there is a drive lane connecting to the property to the west that would allow access to Eckel Junction Road from that property's access also. The location of drives is consistent with the City's requirements for alignment, site distance and proximity to existing drives.
- **Lighting:** A lighting plan has been provided indicating compliance with on-site lighting requirements and light "spillage". I-2 zoning permits light fixtures to be 35 feet high and the tallest fixtures on this site are 30 feet in height.

- **Building Materials:** The building is primarily constructed of metal panels, some glass/glazing and some faced brick. The architect has not provided a building material percentage calculation and without this it is difficult to determine whether the building as proposed meets the percentage requirements. It appears that the use of metal panels would exceed the allowable 75%. Due to the size of the building and numerous “match lines” on the provided plans it is recommended to require a material percentage calculation be supplied.
- **Building Design:** The applicants have provided building elevation sheets for all sides of the building. Due to the length and overall size of the building the requirements of Ch. 1250.481 (a) – (h) shall also be considered. On large buildings such as this the code requires that various recesses and projects be incorporated into the buildings design to provide for visual interest and to reduce the overall perceived scale of the building. The following are the specific requirements related to building design:
 - a) All facades of a principal building that directly face an abutting public street shall feature at least one customer entrance.
 - b) Facades greater than 100 feet in length shall incorporate recesses and projections a minimum of three feet in depth and a minimum of 20 contiguous feet within each 100 feet of facade length. Windows, awnings, entry areas, and arcades shall total at least sixty percent (60%) of the facade length facing a public street.
 - c) Smaller retail spaces that are part of a larger principal retail building shall be transparent between the height of three feet (3') and eight feet (8') above the walkway grade for no less than sixty percent (60%) of the horizontal length of the building facade. Windows shall be recessed and should include visually prominent sills, shutters or such forms of framing. Smaller retail spaces shall have separate outside entrances.
 - d) Building facades shall include a repeating pattern that shall include no less than three of the following elements: color change, texture change, material module change, or expression of architectural or structural bay through a change in plane no less than twelve inches (12") in width, such as an offset, reveal, or projecting rib. At least one of these elements shall repeat horizontally. All elements shall repeat at intervals of no more than thirty feet (30'), either horizontally or vertically.
 - e) Roof lines shall provide variations to reduce the massive scale of these structures and to add visual interest. Roof lines shall have a change in height every 100 linear feet in the building length. Parapets, mansard roofs, gable roofs, hip roofs, or dormers shall be used to conceal flat roofs and roof top mechanical equipment from the public view.

- f) Facade colors shall be of low reflectance, subtle, neutral or earth tone colors. The use of high intensity colors, metallic colors, black or fluorescent colors is prohibited.
- g) Building trim may feature brighter colors than facade colors, but illuminated tubing is prohibited.
- h) Each principle building or tenant space shall have a clearly defined, highly visible customer entrance with a minimum of three of the following features: canopies, porticos, overhangs, recesses/projections, arcades, raised cornice parapets over the door, peaked roof forms, outdoor patios, display windows, architectural details such as tile work and moldings which are integrated into the building structure and design, integral planters or wing walls that incorporate landscape areas and/or places for sitting.
- **Accessory Buildings:** The code allows for accessory buildings (defined as “A subordinate structure, located on the same lot as the principal building, the use of which is naturally or normally incidental to the principal use of the principal building or land.”) provided they meet the following requirements:
 - The combined footprints of all accessory buildings on a lot shall not exceed the lesser of 5% of the lot size or 4,000 SF. The BZA may consider an exception to the maximum size requirement providing that the requested size does not exceed 8% of the lot size.
 - Not be taller than 20’ in height
 - Not be located closer than 10’ to the principal structure
 - Adhere to the same building material requirement percentages as the principal structure
 - Be located in a rear yard
- **Fencing:** Fencing is permitted on this site at a height of four (4) feet. Six (6) foot fencing may be permitted if the BZA grants a variance. Additionally the use of chain-link fencing in a front yard is prohibited so the applicants have shown a decorative aluminum fence for the frontage along Eckel Junction Road. It is also important to note that barbed wire is not permitted anywhere on this site.
- **General Engineering:** The applicant shall submit and obtain City of Perrysburg engineering approvals for site civil construction plans, including pavement and drainage, water, storm and sanitary sewer prior to a zoning permit being issued. A zoning permit is required prior to Wood County issuing a building permit.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator has reviewed all necessary information for the consideration of the preliminary and final site plan and recommends approval of final site plan with the following conditions:

1. Payment of intersection contribution fees.
2. Reduce the overall height of the accessory building/wash bay to comply with the 20 foot height maximum or figure out a way to attach it to the main building so as to avoid the requirements associated with accessory building height.
3. Any and all variances be obtained by the Board of Zoning Appeals for accessory building size. The use of the accessory building cannot be considered a second principal building due to its clear and obvious subordinate role to the larger building.
4. Any and all variances be obtained by the Board of Zoning Appeals for fencing that exceeds four (4) foot height in the front yard.
5. The landscape plan must be revised to show shade trees in provided landscape islands.
6. Provide site irrigation for landscaped areas.
7. Provide landscape coverage percentage for the provided parking lot area(s) to verify compliance with 6% minimum.
8. Provide a building material percentage calculation to demonstrate compliance with the maximum percentage of metal siding.
9. The building materials of the accessory building need to be changed to comply with Ch. 1250.48 which would not permit 100% metal siding.
10. The north, west and south elevation of the principal building will need to be modified to comply with Ch. 1250.481.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. Site 13017 Eckel Junction Road was discussed with site 13017 Eckel Junction Road in the above minutes.

Mr. Wellstein moved to approve the Preliminary Site Plan, and to grant conditional approval with the conditions listed in this report, with an administrative review for the Final Site Plan for Ohio CAT at 13017 Eckel Junction Road. Seconded by Mayor Mackin. Ayes: (5). Nays: (0).

Other Business

Mr. Walters briefly explained the CRA composition and membership, and asked for a member of the Planning Commission to be appointed to the board to fill the current vacancy.

Mr. Wellstein nominated Greg Bade. Seconded by Mayor Mackin. Ayes: (5). Nays: (0).

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:19 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Heather Alfaro