

PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

JULY 31, 2014

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chairman Chris Carry. Commission members present were: Chris Carry, Byron Choka, Tom Forquer, Seth Hudson, and Mayor Olmstead (5). Greg Bade and Therese Witt were absent (2). Also present were Brody Walters, Planning and Zoning Administrator and Mathew Beredo, Law Director.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Choka moved to approve the minutes of the June 26, 2014 meeting as written. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hudson and was unanimously approved.

Mr. Hudson moved to approve the minutes as written of the July 17, 2014 special meeting. Mr. Carry seconded and the motion was approved 4-0. Ayes: Carry, Forquer, Hudson, and Olmstead (4). Abstain: Choka (1).

ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT

Mr. Walters stated that the Preliminary Plat for Reserve at Prairie Woods has been withdrawn from tonight's agenda. He stated that an extension for the preliminary plat for Riverford 6 was timely received, but the Final Plat has also been received and will be on the August agenda so that extension will not be considered tonight. Also anticipated to be on the August agenda is the Final Site Plan for Taco Bell and a proposed Code Amendment regarding Section 1225.08, Land Use Table.

Assignment of Permanent Zoning Sharma Annexation

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

Kathy Sharma
25700 W. River Road
Perrysburg, Ohio 43551

REQUEST

Chapter 1285 – Changes and Amendments
Chapter 1285.11 – Zoning of Newly Annexed Areas

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

The subject properties are located north of Roachton Road, between W. River Road and Normandy Road. Parcel numbers: P60-100-564406017000, P60-100-564406016000, and P60-100-564406010000. Currently parcel "7000" contains the home of the applicant while the applicant's other two properties are vacant.

Annexation to the City of Perrysburg was effective on July 17, 2014. While in Perrysburg Township these properties were zoned A1 (Agricultural). The total annexation area is comprised of approximately 3.46 acres.

BACKGROUND

The applicant submitted a request for water and sewer service on May 15, 2013 requesting the extension of water and/or sanitary sewer from the City of Perrysburg. A Municipal Utility Overlay was granted for the property on July 9, 2013 and annexation was effective (into the City) on July 17, 2014.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning & Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission recommend to City Council approval of the assignment of permanent zoning of R1 (Single-Family Residential) for the three parcels identified in this report. Further, it is recommended that a public hearing be set before City Council for September 16, 2014 at 6:20 p.m.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. The applicant was not present, but Mr. Walters said that R1 zoning is consistent with their wishes. Vaughn Levy who lives next door to the recently annexed area had concerns about the property and that he was not notified about a lot split. It was explained that there is no notification process necessary for lot splits and that his concerns are homeowner association issues and the City does not get involved with homeowner association requirements.

Mr. Forquer made a motion to recommend to City Council assignment of permanent zoning of R1 (Single-Family Residential) for the three parcels contained in the Sharma Annexation. Mr. Carry seconded and it was unanimously approved.

Preliminary Plat Extension Villages at Canterbury

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

Mr. Mark Rich
23285 W. SR 51
Genoa, Ohio 43430

Feller Finch and Associates, Inc.
1683 Woodlands Drive, P.O. Box 68
Maumee, Ohio 43537

REQUEST

Chapter 1295.01 – Preliminary Plat
Chapter 1295.06(i) – Tentative Approval Time Limit: Plat Resubmission

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

The Villages at Canterbury is a proposed subdivision consisting of 453 lots located at the southeast corner of Roachton Road and Hull Prairie Road. It is bordered to the east by the CSX railroad tracks. The subject property is currently zoned R4 (Single Family Residential) and contains 5 parcels comprising approximately 222.85 acres.

BACKGROUND

On June 3, 2011, the annexation into the City of Perrysburg was completed.

On October 4, 2011, permanent zoning of R4 (Single Family Residential) was approved by City Council.

On June 28, 2012, Planning Commission considered a preliminary plat request for The Villages at Canterbury. During the review, issues related to drainage, right-of-way, easements, and open space were identified and the Planning Commission tabled the issue until these issues could be resolved / further explored.

On July 26, 2012, Planning Commission un-tabled the preliminary plat request for The Villages at Canterbury and was presented with a revised preliminary plat drawing, which addressed the issues from the previous meeting. At this meeting a preliminary plat was approved by the Planning Commission subject to the comments and recommendations included in the report.

Dr. Rich has recently applied for a preliminary plat extension per Chapter 1295.06(i) to renew the approval that was granted on July 26, 2012. As part of the extension submission, a revised preliminary plat was also submitted and found to contain only minor deviations from the approved plan. The Planning and Zoning Administrator has determined these changes to be “minor” and therefore eligible for consideration as an extension.

ANALYSIS

The City of Perrysburg’s current Comprehensive Plan indicates “Controlled Growth/Traditional Neighborhood Area.”

The subject property is currently vacant and being farmed.

The Code provides for a minimum lot area of 9,500 S.F. for R-4 Zoning. All proposed lots currently meet or exceed the minimum lot size.

The subject property shall be subject to Chapter 1295 – Subdivision Regulations.

When comparing the most recent revised plan to the plans that were approved on July 28, 2012 the following changes were identified;

- **2 new detention ponds along Roachton Road, which generally affect lots 13, 14, 15, 16, 22, 23, 24, 25, 100, 101, and 102.**

- The addition of an “eye-brow” cul-de-sac at the northeast corner of the development.
- The relocation of the eastern most stub street (moved further south).
- The curvature of Winfield Manor Road (was previously straight).
- A lot was relocated out of the large open space area nearest Hull Prairie Road, making the area more open from Wellington Place Road.

City Staff has reviewed the revised changes for the Villages at Canterbury and has looked for any code items that may have changed since the original approval and has provided the following comments:

City Engineer:

General

- Under Lot Analysis explain side yard minimum 6', 16 feet total, provide side yard minimum based on a minimum 8' wide drainage easement
- Provide a traffic impact study for the full build out conditions to determine need for turn lanes on Hull Prairie Road.
- No pump station permitted. Follow sanitary sewer master plan / SICR.

Public Utilities:

General

- Extend water and sewer to southern most point of project
- Remove pump Station. Not Permitted.

Planning & Zoning:

General

- Lots must have at least 65' of frontage along a street, unless approved by Planning Commission. In no case shall a lot have a width less than 65' at the building line.
- Lots shall not have an average depth that is more than three times its average width.
- Perimeter open space along Roachton Rd. and Hull Prairie Rd. should be of sufficient width to accommodate ditch, landscape screening, and 15' bicycle path easement.
- Preliminary Plan should include proposed method of public open space dedication: 5% of the area of subdivision or cash in lieu of dedication.
- Provide bike path in lieu of sidewalk along Roachton Rd. and Hull Prairie Rd.
- Sidewalks are required to be 5' rather than 4' shown on plat.
- Crosswalks to be provided where blocks exceed 900 feet in length.

Preliminary Plat approval shall be effective for a maximum period of twelve (12) months unless, upon application of the developer, the Planning Commission grants an extension. If the Final Plat has not been recorded within this time limit, the Preliminary Plat must again be submitted to the Planning Commission for approval.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission acknowledge the revised changes and extend the approval of the submitted preliminary plat for 12 months (expiration of July 31, 2015) subject to the comments and recommendations contained in this report.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. He noted that an extension for the preliminary plat was approved on June 27, 2013 but that date was omitted from the report. Mr. Rich was present to answer questions from the Commission. There were questions about the pump station, and Mr. Rich said that is why he is developing the Hawthorne subdivision before Canterbury.

Mr. Carry moved to approve the extension of the Preliminary Plat of the Villages at Canterbury until July 31, 2015, acknowledging the changes made to the plat. Mr. Choka seconded and it was unanimously approved.

Preliminary & Final Site Plan Owens-Illinois Plaza 5 Expansion 2055 North Wilkinson Way (Innovation Center)

APPLICANT

Mr. Paul Furtaw, PE
Bergmann Associates
1427 W. Saginaw Street, Ste 200
East Lansing, MI 48823

OWNER

Owens-Illinois, Inc.
Four O-I Plaza
One Michael Owens Way
Perrysburg, OH 43551

REQUEST

Chapter 1260.08 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1260.10 – Final Site Plan Review

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

Owens Illinois proposes to expand the existing Plaza 5 Building (Innovation Center). The proposed expansion would be on the east side of the building facing N. Wilkinson Way. The subject property is approximately 4 acres of the larger Owens-Illinois property, which is zoned I-2 “General Industrial” and is located north and west of N. Wilkinson Way.

The site is bordered on the east and south by other industrial/manufacturing uses and is bordered on the west by the CSX rail line. The submitted plans show an addition that is

25' x 77' in size located toward the existing parking lot. Additionally, a "cooling tower" is shown between the existing driveway and the proposed addition.

The proposed addition would bring the existing face of the building outward to the far edge of the existing parking lot. Due to the proximity of the parking lot to the wall of the building the plans indicate a highway guardrail for protection. The proposed addition will result in a loss of 10 of the 39 parking spaces.

The proposed site plan indicates 29 remaining parking spaces on site in addition to the shared parking lot to the northeast at O-I Plaza Four.

ANALYSIS

The submitted plans for this project have been found to be consistent with the dimensional standards of Chapter 1230 including maximum height and the 60' front yard setback requirement.

Per Chapter 1250 Site Design Standards, the following items were reviewed:

- **Parking:** The existing Innovation Center with 23,000 SF and the proposed addition of 1,932 SF totals 24,932 SF.
Equation: $(24,932 \text{ SF} \times .75) / 450\text{SF} = 42$ required parking spaces.
Although the parking count is less than required number, there is an additional shared parking lot that has not been used in this calculation. Specific parking count concerns should be asked of the applicant.
- **Landscaping:** Eight additional spruce trees are proposed (5 along the driveway and 3 along the drive near the parking lot).
- **Signage:** No additional signage is requested as a result of this site addition.
- **Lighting:** No lighting is shown on/for the proposed building.
- **Building Materials:** The proposed addition is shown to be made from ribbed metal panels and concrete (CMU). The building material percentages are consistent with Chapter 1250.48 for industrial zoning (neither of these materials comprises more than 75% of the building surface).
- **Other:** All other aspects of the site were reviewed and approved by the Planning Commission at previous meetings on November 15, 2012, July 25, 2013 and January 31, 2014. All reviewed features appear to remain in compliance with the development standards and as such do not require further review.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission approve the preliminary and final site plan depicting the construction of the proposed 25' x 77' addition as submitted and require that the cooling tower feature be brought back to

the Planning Commission for additional approval once final details and elevations can be provided.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. Veronica Millon, Project Manager, and Tom Reder of Bergmann Associates were present to represent O-I. Ms. Millon explained that this is the first of three planned expansions. Mr. Reder distributed plans to Commission members for the cooling tower and for enclosing the existing serpentine sidewalk from Building 4 to the Innovation Center. Ms. Millon said that the plans show screening around the cooling tower and enclosing the sidewalk will also help provide screening. Mr. Reder said that when plans were originally submitted they did not know how tall the cooling tower would be and the decision about the connector had not been made. He asked that the Planning and Zoning Administrator be granted authority to approve the plans administratively instead of coming back to the Planning Commission. Mr. Reder said that with regard to the parking there is a lot of parking on campus and it doesn't make sense to configure the parking lot right now because of the future expansions. They plan to reconfigure the lot with future expansions and provide parking for this building. Mr. Reder explained that the cooling tower is an integral part of the process.

Mr. Choka asked about the timing of future expansions. Ms. Millon said that she anticipates the next one either in the third or fourth quarter of 2015, but she does not have a timeline for the third expansion. She noted that this expansion is happening a year earlier than originally planned. Mayor Olmstead said that they have laid out their intentions and he is comfortable with letting Mr. Walters review it administratively. Mr. Walters asked about the percentages on the building materials. Mr. Reder said that they are close and they are hoping to offset it with the connector. Mr. Forquer asked if all the buildings are permanent, and Mr. Reder said that they are all permanent and are heated and fire suppressed. Mr. Carry said that he has concerns regarding some site issues such as tall grass and dumpsters at the construction site, but otherwise he has no issues.

Mr. Hudson moved to approve the preliminary and final site plan depicting the construction of the proposed 25' x 77' addition as submitted and giving the Planning and Zoning Administrator the authority to administratively approve the plans for the cooling tower and sidewalk enclosure. Mr. Forquer seconded and it was unanimously approved.

Preliminary Site Plan Review

Taco Bell

N. Dixie Hwy. between Lincoln Blvd. and Gloria St.

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

George Kentris
G-Made, Inc.
2738 N. Main St., Suite A
Findlay, OH 45840

Dan Stone
Van Horn Hoover & Assoc.
P.O. Box 612
Findlay, OH 45839

Lane Williamson
Eastman & Smith, Ltd.
One Seagate 24th Floor
P.O. Box 10032
Toledo, Ohio 43699

REQUEST

Chapter 1260.05 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1245.29 – SR25 Corridor Overlay
Chapter 1250 – Site Design Standards

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

Location: The subject property is located on the east side of N. Dixie Highway, south of Lincoln Blvd. and north of Gloria Street. “Social” restaurant is the immediate neighbor to the north of this property. This application includes 15 parcels. Lot 577 was intentionally removed from this request by the applicant and lots 705 and 754 are only partially used.

Property Size: .939 acres

Parcels: Q61-400-180303022000	Q61-400-180303015000	Q61-400-180303013000
Q61-400-180303021000	Q61-400-180303005000	Q61-400-180303012000
Q61-400-180303020000	Q61-400-180303014000	Q61-400-180303011000
Q61-400-180303019000	Q61-400-180303006000	
Q61-400-180303018000	Q61-400-180303007000	
Q61-400-180303017000	Q61-400-180303008000	
Q61-400-180303016000	Q61-400-180303009000	

BACKGROUND

This property was previously used for the parking lot of the DC Ranch/Rose Room. Additionally, this area also contained a “Water Shed” (NWWSD) that has since been removed and a large billboard sign that is still present. The property has been vacant for several years and has only been used for overflow parking of “Social” restaurant. This land was recently purchased by G-Made, Inc. to be utilized as a Taco Bell restaurant.

ANALYSIS

The applicants have provided the necessary documents to conduct a preliminary site plan review for the proposed Taco Bell. This application will be reviewed according to the requirements for preliminary site plan and Corridor Overlay requirements.

Preliminary Site Plan

- **Zoning:** C4 (Highway Commercial) with Corridor Overlay

- **Setbacks:** Front: 50 ft. (*this property has 3 front yards, one along each street*)
Side: 10 ft. minimum (*this property has no side yards*)
Rear: 30 ft.
- **Adjacent Zoning/Uses:**
 North – C4 Highway Commercial (Social)
 East – C4 Highway Commercial (vacant)
 South – C4 Highway Commercial (vacant, Café Marie Plaza)
 West – PBP/UVO (Levis Commons)
- **Land Use(s):** Restaurant Fast-Food
- **Site Layout:** The applicants propose to construct a Taco Bell in approximately the center of the property, with parking in the front and rear. Access to the site is shown to be from Lincoln and Gloria, not directly from N. Dixie Hwy and these curb cuts are well positioned away from Dixie Hwy as not to create stacking issues.

Between lot 576 and 577, there is not an adequate buffer between the parcels as the code requires a minimum of a 5' landscape buffer.

There is a drive-thru located along the rear façade of the building.

The applicant has parking located within the required front yard setback and has received a variance from the BZA allowing these 21 parking spaces (*BZA case # 18-14*).

Also present on site is a dumpster enclosure located in the rear yard and the screen wall along SR25 that is required as part of the corridor overlay.

- **Roads and Access:** A Traffic Impact Study has not been submitted to the City for this project but shall be required prior to final site plan approval.
- **Parking:** The site plan identifies 44 parking spaces. The code requires 17 parking spaces to accommodate 1,983 SF of usable floor area and 7 employees. Parking spaces are shown to be 10' x 20' in size with 24' drive aisles.
- **Landscape Islands:** As the site plan indicates, the applicant has provided landscape islands in locations to break up parking lot rows into 10 cars or less which meets the requirement of the code which specifies that 1 landscape island be provided per each 10 parking spaces.
- **Sidewalks:** Public sidewalks are required across all frontages and are shown on the site plan. In the middle of the screen wall a sidewalk is shown that will provide pedestrian access to the front entrances of the proposed building.

- **General Engineering:** The applicant shall submit and obtain City of Perrysburg engineering approvals for site civil construction plans, including pavement and drainage, water, storm and sanitary sewer prior to a zoning permit being issued. A zoning permit is required prior to Wood County issuing a building permit. Additionally, a pre-construction meeting is required prior to permitting by the City of Perrysburg.

Corridor Overlay

The corridor overlay requirements Per Ch. 1245.33 pertain to non-residential properties abutting SR25 and include the following:

- (a) **Utility Lines:** All utility lines such as electric, telephone, CATV or other similar lines shall be installed underground. All junction and access boxes shall be screened with appropriate landscaping.
- (b) **Loading Areas:** Sites shall be designed and buildings shall be oriented so that loading areas are visually screened.
- (c) **Building Materials:** No building facade shall consist of architectural materials which differ in composition, appearance or detail from any other façade of the same building. The intent of this requirement is to preclude the use of inferior materials on sides which face adjoining property. Mechanical equipment, whether ground-level or rooftop, shall be shielded and screened from public view.
- (d) **Exterior Lighting:** All exterior lights shall be arranged and installed to comply with the exterior lighting provisions of this Zoning Code.
- (e) **Parking Lots Adjacent to Public Right-of-Way:** Parking lots, which have frontage along a public right-of-way, shall be screened with a wall and landscaping.
- (f) **Landscaping along Corridor:** The area of land between the property line and the curb, typically known as the terrace, shall be landscaped with street trees.
- (g) **Driveways and Parking Areas:** Driveways and parking areas shall be paved. Concrete curb and gutters shall be installed around the perimeter of all driveways and parking areas.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator has reviewed all necessary information for the consideration of the preliminary site plan and recommends denying the preliminary site plan as submitted. Two outstanding issues exist with this application, specifically the exclusion of Lot 577 from the site plan and the lack of the required 5' landscape buffer between Lots 576 and 577. It is recommended to require the inclusion of Lot 577 in any future approved site plan. Additionally the inclusion of Lot 577 would permit consistent development along the corridor of S.R. 25 (including street trees and the screen wall) and would require the removal of the non-conforming billboard structure present on the site. A copy of the billboard lease has been included with this report and it is believed

the language (bottom of numbered page 2) permits the applicant to require the removal of the billboard should this application be denied or similarly conditioned.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. He called attention to a letter received from Carlton Alder of 12492 Gloria Street. Mr. Alder expressed concerns about another business going in near his home and he requested that a privacy fence be erected between the business and his home. Dan Stone of Van Horn Hoover & Associates was present. He stated that with regard to the two outstanding issues Mr. Walters noted, they have modified the site plan to include a 5' landscape buffer. He said that including lot 577 in the site plan is a difficult situation because the owner is in contract for the sign until 2021. Mr. Forquer noted that the Planning and Zoning Administrator has interpreted the language in the lease that it could be removed based on certain circumstances. Attorney Jeff Stopar said that there has been a series of email requests made to the lessee asking to remove the sign and those requests have been denied. He said that this is a legitimate legal dispute and lot 577 is not included in this site plan. Mayor Olmstead said it is not included because they carved it out and if they included it, the dispute would go away. Mark Chudzinski said that the removal clause says that the sign must interfere with construction of the actual building and there is no way the billboard is going to touch the building. He said the sign was approved when it was in the Township and it has legal non-conforming status. Mr. Carry asked Mr. Walters about the legal non-conforming status. Mr. Walters said that he feel it loses that status with the development of the site. There was a lengthy discussion regarding possible alternatives for dealing with the existing billboard. Mr. Beredo said that there is no promise that the property owner can make that will provide the City with a remedy, and we would be in the exact same situation eight years from now when the lease expires. Mayor Olmstead said that he does not have a problem with the development, but he questioned how the City would govern future development if they approved this. Mr. Stopar said that he does not know what authority the City has to include lot 577 when the site plan does not include it. Mr. Walters said that zoning setbacks are taken from each individual lot so a lot combination would be required. That process is a subjective review and he would not approve a lot combination that excludes lot 577.

Mr. Carry moved to deny the Preliminary Site Plan for Taco Bell. Mr. Hudson seconded, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Preliminary & Final Site Plan Review
Kroger
27386 Carronade Drive

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

Jason Case
The Kroger Company
4111 Executive Parkway
Westerville, OH 43081

REQUEST

Chapter 1260.05 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1260.08 – Final Site Plan Review
Chapter 1250 – Site Design Standards

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

Location: The subject property is located very near the intersection of Carronade Drive and U.S. 20, on the southeast side of Carronade Drive.

Property Size: 18.65 total acres

Parcels: Q61-400-090109001000 and Q61-400-090109004000

BACKGROUND

These parcels currently contain an existing Kroger grocery store as well as a large vacant retail space that was previously used by Kmart and Sears. The applicant proposes to demolish the entire strip center to construct a new Kroger building along with new retail space(s) (14,000 SF) for unnamed tenants.

ANALYSIS

The applicants have provided the necessary documents to conduct a joint preliminary and final site plan review for the proposed Kroger store and the other proposed retail space. This application will be reviewed according to the requirements for preliminary and final site plan.

Preliminary Site Plan

- **Zoning:** C3 (Community Shopping)
- **Setbacks:** Front: 50 ft.
Side: 20 ft. total
Rear: 35 ft.
- **Adjacent Zoning/Uses:**
 - North** – C4 - Highway Commercial (Panera Bread, Subway, Car Wash)
 - East** – Township Commercial
 - South** – RM - Multi-Family (vacant), and Township Residential
 - West** – RM - Multi- Family (vacant), (C4 – Hotel)
- **Land Use(s):** Grocery (Permitted)
Retail Space (Permitted)
- **Site Layout:** The applicant proposes to demolish the existing buildings onsite and construct a new 123,662 SF building to be occupied by Kroger grocery. Additionally, in the northeast area of the property, between the proposed new Kroger and the existing gas station, 14,000 SF of retail space is proposed. The proposed Kroger store is shown to be located roughly where the vacant Kmart

store is located now. All required setbacks are represented accurately on the provided drawings and all features on site are shown to comply with all setbacks and otherwise applicable base zoning requirements with the exception of parking in the required front yard which received a variance by the BZA on July 14, 2014.

- **Roads and Access:** All current points of access along Carronade Drive and Miller Drive are proposed to remain as they currently exist. A Traffic Impact Study has not been requested for this development due to its previous uses, and location to existing roadways. The City of Perrysburg Division of Engineering shall retain the right to request traffic information during construction review if necessary.

Final Site Plan

- **Parking:** The site plan provides a detailed parking analysis for this site. The code requires 704 parking spaces to accommodate the proposed uses and the applicants have provided 833. Additionally, the drive aisle widths meet and exceed the minimum requirement of 20'.
- **Landscape Islands:** As the site plan indicates, the applicant has provided landscape islands in locations to break up parking lot rows into 10 cars or less which meets the requirement of the code which specifies that 1 landscape island be provided per each 10 parking spaces.
- **Parking Lot Landscape:** The parking lot landscaping is primarily comprised of shade trees in islands and around the perimeter and does also feature other areas of additional landscaping. The provided landscape plan indicates that the 6% landscape requirement has been met and slightly exceeded. Additionally, the code requires 1 tree on site for each 8 spaces (104 required) and this requirement has not been met as only 82 trees are shown.
- **Site Landscaping:** The landscape plan indicates substantial landscape onsite but the plan does not quantify the percentage of onsite landscaping. Perimeter landscaping has been included along the public right-of-ways. The code requires that at least 10% of the site is landscaped.
- **Signage:** Signage shown on the provided submission is preliminary and will be reviewed in accordance with Ch. 1250.29 prior to the issuance of any sign permits, but the submission does indicate that the existing non-conforming, off-premise sign will be remedied by relocating the signage onto the Kroger property.
- **Lighting:** C-3 zoning permits light fixtures to be 30'. The applicant has provided an acceptable lighting plan but has not indicated the height of the pole fixtures.
- **Building Materials:** The applicant is proposing a very attractive, high quality building that is consistent with the standards of other Kroger facilities. The building makes use of CMU, metal, stone, masonry, and aluminum. Although

building material percentages are not shown on the building elevation sheets, it is evident that the materials have been arranged in a manner and quantity that would be acceptable to the code requirements of Ch. 1250.48. All of the building materials that are proposed are both visually interesting and very durable. It is important to note that the building materials for the proposed 14,000 SF retail space have not been identified and future development of this area shall require additional review as a final site plan.

- **Sidewalks:** 5' public sidewalks are required across all frontages and are shown on the site plan. The plan does not currently show sidewalks through the driveways nor do the plans indicate that a pedestrian walkway will be provided from Carronade Drive to the store entrance.
- **General Engineering:** The applicant shall submit and obtain City of Perrysburg engineering approvals for site civil construction plans, including pavement and drainage, water, storm and sanitary sewer prior to a zoning permit being issued. A zoning permit is required prior to Wood County issuing a building permit. Additionally, a pre-construction meeting is required prior to permitting by the City of Perrysburg.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator has reviewed all necessary information for the consideration of the preliminary and final site plan and recommends conditional approval of the preliminary site plan only. Further, the administrator recommends that preliminary and final site plan approval be subject to the fulfillment of the following conditions:

1. Tree count on site be increased from 82 to 104 per Ch. 1250.18(c)
2. The onsite landscape percentage be calculated by the L.A. and meet or exceed 10%.
3. Light poles shall be $\leq 30'$
4. Sidewalks shall be shown through all driveways and a single sidewalk shall be shown from Carronade Drive to the store entrance area. Ch. 1250.56
5. Pedestrian crossing areas in front of the storefront shown as diagonal paint lines shall be reconfigured to be stamped or colored concrete/asphalt.
6. A 5' landscape buffer shall be provided between drive-thru area and adjacent property line.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. Andrew Gardner of Bird & Bull Engineering was present to represent Kroger. He distributed a modified Site Plan. He said they have adjusted the tree count to 104, the landscape percentage is 26.8%, and the 30' requirement regarding the light poles will be met, and they will address the sidewalk connection. He said they have a concern regarding the striped area being changed to stamped concrete. He said that he understands it looks nice, but they have had problems with maintaining them and they get complaints from customers about the raised texture. Mr. Walters said the Code does allow for a change in color without a

change in texture. Mr. Hudson asked if they plan to repave the parking area. Mr. Gardner said they will use what they can, but it will look like a brand new center. He said that with regard to #6 in Mr. Walters' recommendations, they have added a hedge row along the drive-thru. Mr. Forquer said that according to the plans the hedge row is on the adjacent property. Mr. Gardner said that is correct. Gary Yunker of Devonshire REIT said that he is the property owner to the south and he is in agreement with the buffer on his property. However, he asked that the number of trees be reduced because he is concerned about visibility of his development. Mr. Carry said that he would be concerned with reducing the number of trees because it could set a precedent. He also said he is not a fan of ginkgo trees because he feels they are a marginal tree at best. Mr. Carry asked about the current sign and Mr. Gardner stated that it will be moved. There was discussion regarding the parking lot for the proposed retail area. Mr. Forquer said he doesn't like head in parking and he is concerned about them backing into an aisleway. Mr. Gardner said that a lot of the Kroger traffic will use the main drive unless they are headed to the fuel center. He said that they don't need to build those spaces until they come back regarding the retail and from a practical standpoint, they won't stripe until they come back for approval of the retail area.

Mr. Carry made a motion to approve the preliminary site plan for Kroger subject to the Planning and Zoning Administrator's administrative review and subject to the tree count on site being increased from 82 to 104, the onsite landscape percentage being calculated by a landscape architect and meeting or exceeding 10%, the light poles being less than or equal to 30' in height, the sidewalks continuing through the driveways and including a single sidewalk from Carronade Drive to the store entrance area, the pedestrian crossing areas in front of the storefront that are shown as diagonal paint lines being reconfigured to be stamped or colored concrete/asphalt, and the 5' landscape buffer being added along the drive-thru area with the agreement of the adjacent property owner that it be on his property. Mr. Forquer seconded the motion and it was approved 4-0. Ayes: Carry, Forquer, Hudson, and Olmstead (4). Abstain: Choka (1).

Mr. Gardner said that they are requesting approval of the Final Site Plan also. Mr. Walters said that his recommendation was to approve only the Preliminary Site Plan because he did not think they would be able to address the outstanding issues, but he would recommend approval of the Final Site Plan subject to receiving a plan that reflects the changes discussed and excluding the retail area.

Mr. Forquer moved to approve the Kroger Final Site Plan subject to compliance with the conditions in the Preliminary Site Plan and excluding the proposed retail. Mr. Carry seconded and it was approved 4-0. Ayes: Carry, Forquer, Hudson and Olmstead (4). Abstain: Choka (1).

OTHER BUSINESS

Mr. Hudson made an amendment to the prior motion with respect to the Taco Bell application specifically stating the reasons for denial being the exclusion of Lot 577 from the Site Plan and the failure to remove the non-conforming billboard which would have lost its legal non-conforming status upon approval of the development of the adjacent parcels. Mr. Carry seconded and it was unanimously approved.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Jo Sutton