PLANNING COMMISSION

AUGUST 27, 2015

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chairman Chris Carry. Commission members present were: Chris Carry, Byron Choka, Tom Forquer, Seth Hudson, Eric Nicely, Mayor Olmstead and Therese Witt (7). Also present was Brody Walters, Planning and Zoning Administrator.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF JULY 30, 2015 MEETING

Mr. Choka moved to approve the minutes of the July 30, 2015 meeting as written. Mr. Carry seconded and they were unanimously approved.

ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT

Mr. Walters reported that there will be a full agenda for the August meeting. He stated that Mark Rich, the developer of the Hawthorne subdivision is in attendance regarding the extension of the Hawthorne Preliminary Plat that was tabled last month.

Preliminary Plat Approval
Hawthorne Subdivision

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER
Mr. Mark Rich
23285 W. SR 51
Genoa, Ohio 43430

Feller Finch and Associates, Inc.
1683 Woodlands Drive, P.O. Box 68
Maumee, Ohio 43537

REQUEST

Chapter 1295.06(i) – Preliminary Plat Extension

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION
The overall Hawthorne subdivision is proposed to consist of 242 lots and is located south of Coe Ct., north of Roachton Rd., and is immediately west of the CSX railroad tracks. The subject property (107.8 acres) is currently zoned R3 (Single Family Residential) and S1 (Scenic and Open Space).

BACKGROUND
On July 25, 2013 the Planning Commission approved the preliminary plat for the Hawthorne subdivision.

On December 19, 2014 the Planning Commission approved the final plat for Hawthorne Plat 1 which consisted of 30 lots.

On March 26, 2015 the Planning Commission approved the final plat for Hawthorne Plat 2 which consisted of 28 lots.

ANALYSIS
The Code requires a minimum lot area of 11,600 S.F. for R-3 Zoning. All proposed lots currently meet or exceed the minimum lot size.

The subject property shall be subject to Chapter 1295 – Subdivision Regulations.

Preliminary Plat approval shall be effective for a maximum period of twelve (12) months unless, upon application of the developer, the Planning Commission grants an extension. If the Final Plat has not been recorded within this time limit, the Preliminary Plat must again be submitted to the Planning Commission for approval.

RECOMMENDATION
The Planning and Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission approve the Preliminary Plat extension for Hawthorne subdivision which shall be valid until July 30, 2016.

Mr. Carry moved to reopen discussion regarding the Preliminary Plat extension for the Hawthorne subdivision. Mayor Olmstead seconded and it was unanimously approved.

Mr. Walters called attention to copies of emails from Fire Chief Jeff Klein and Commissioner of Public Utilities Mark Dunsmoor in support of the extension of Ringle Road for safety and utility purposes. Mr. Rich said that he would answer any questions the Commission has for him.

Mr. Carry moved to extend approval of the Preliminary Plat for the Hawthorne subdivision to July 30, 2016. Mayor Olmstead seconded and it was approved 5-2. Ayes: Carry, Choka, Hudson, Nicely, Olmstead (5). Ayes: Forquer, Witt (2).

Preliminary and Final Site Plan Approval
Wendy's Restaurant
26630 Dixie Highway

APPLICANT
Geo-Graphics, Inc.
3331 Livingston Ave.
Columbus, OH 43227

OWNER
Rebecca Williams
217 E. Front Street
Pemberville, OH

REQUEST
Chapter 1260 – Preliminary and Final Site Plan Review

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION
The applicant proposes to add an additional drive-thru lane creating a "Y-Lane" drive-thru order station. The site is bordered on the north by Huntington Bank and to the south by the AA Green Building. The current site and all immediate properties are zoned C-4 highway commercial with the exception of RiverPlace Shopping Center which is zoned C-3 community shopping. All properties fronting Dixie Highway are within the Corridor Overlay District.

ANALYSIS
The applicant desires to add an additional drive-thru lane to accommodate more customers using the outdoor ordering stations. The proposed work would result in the loss of one parking space and the relocation of 2 existing handicap spaces to another area of the parking lot very near the south customer entrance door. All other aspects of the site plan are proposed to remain the same. The previous final site plan was approved on 6-27-13 so the remaining areas of review are considered to remain in compliance with the exception of parking. Although the number of parking spaces does not meet the number required by code, this is an existing site in which every attempt has been made to achieve the maximum number of parking spaces possible. The owner should be prepared to address the parking needs of this business as it relates to the loss of a spot for the benefit of the additional drive-thru lane. The code requires 4 stacking spaces for each ordering station and page CE-3 shows 12 spaces when only 8 are required.

RECOMMENDATION
The Planning and Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission approve the Preliminary and Final Site Plan for the Wendy's restaurant drive-thru expansion as submitted.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. He called attention to a letter received from A.A. Green, a neighboring property owner, in support of this project. Becky Williams, owner of Wendy's was present.

Ms. Witt questioned the amount of space between the farthest drive thru lane and the parking in the rear. Mr. Carry said that the edge of the concrete is over 20' to the striped stall so there should be plenty of space. Mr. Choka asked Mr. Walters if the location of the handicapped spots is acceptable to him. Mr. Walters said that they are more in line with where they should be with this plan than their current location.

Mr. Carry moved to approve the Preliminary and Final Site Plan for the Wendy's restaurant drive-thru expansion as submitted. Mr. Hudson seconded and it was approved 6-1. Ayes: Carry, Choka, Forquer, Hudson, Nicely and Olmstead (6). Nays: Witt (1).

Ms. Williams asked if construction drawings need to be submitted. Mr. Walters said there is no permit required for the additional drive-thru, but drainage calculations do need to be submitted.

Preliminary and Final Site Plan
Kroger
Carronade Drive

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER

SSOE, Inc.
1050 Wilshire Dr. #260
Troy, Michigan 48084

The Kroger Company
4111 Executive Parkway
Westerville, OH 43081

REQUEST
Chapter 1260.05 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1260.08 – Final Site Plan Review
Chapter 1250 – Site Design Standards

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

Location: The subject property is located very near the intersection of Carronade Drive and U.S. 20, on the southeast side of Carronade Drive. It is approximately 18.65 acres in size and is zoned C-3 Community Shopping.

Parcels: Q61-400-090109001000 and Q61-400-090109004000

BACKGROUND
On July 31, 2014 the Planning Commission approved a final site plan for the construction of a new Kroger Marketplace store along with the demolition of the current Kroger building. This most recent approval will result in a new Kroger store where the Kmart was formerly located and the current Kroger store will be demolished to provide a smaller retail area. The current request by Kroger is to upgrade the existing fuel center by adding an additional pump island, upgrading the center kiosk and making other minor visual changes.

ANALYSIS

Due to the recent site plan approvals for this site it has been determined that the applicants have provided the necessary documents to conduct a joint preliminary and final site plan review for the proposed Kroger fuel station.

Preliminary Site Plan

- **C-3 Setbacks:** Front: 50 ft.
  Side: 20 ft. total
  Rear: 35 ft.

- **Adjacent Zoning/Uses:**
  North – C4 - Highway Commercial (Panera Bread, Subway, Car Wash)

  East – Township Commercial

  South – RM - Multi-Family (vacant), and Township Residential

  West – RM - Multi- Family (vacant), (C4 – Hotel)

- **Site Layout:** The fuel center is proposed to remain in the same location on site but will be expanded towards SR20 to accommodate an additional pump island. This additional width will require the loss of 2 parking spaces located immediately northeast of the gas station canopy.

- **Roads and Access:** All current points of access along Carronade Drive and Miller Drive are proposed to remain as they currently exist. A Traffic Impact Study has not been requested for this development due to its previous uses, and location to existing roadways.

Final Site Plan

- **Parking:** Parking is generally not impacted by this proposed fuel center update. The only change in parking would be the loss of two parking spaces near the NE end of the fuel center. During the previous site plan reviews it was determined that Kroger had a sufficient number of parking spaces so this loss of 2 is not expected to be a concern (the code requires 704 parking spaces to accommodate the proposed uses and the applicants have provided 831)

- **Landscape Islands:** In the location of the parking lot where the 2 parking spaces will be lost, the applicant has shown the end border of the parking row to be striped pavement. It is recommended to require that this striped area be converted to a raised, curbed landscape island instead of utilizing paint to delineate the parking border. This is also recommended due to the quantity and various sizes of vehicles

that will be traveling next to this area. A raised curb island will provide additional protection for vehicles parked near this exit driveway.

- **Parking Lot Landscape:** It is recommended to require a tree be installed in the landscape island described above. The previous staff report for the new Kroger building identified a deficiency in the number of overall trees on site so this would seem to be an appropriate request for this available island. (104 trees required, 82 trees shown).
- **Signage:** Signage shown on the provided submission is not being reviewed at this time. Signage will be reviewed at the time a sign permit application is made to the Planning and Zoning Division but generally the use of signage on the gas station canopy will be limited to 1 sign on up to 2 different sides. It is expected that Kroger would utilize the sides of the canopy that face SR20 and the large portion of the parking lot.

- **Lighting:** Lighting is expected to be limited to flush mount canopy lighting.

- **Building Materials:** The applicant is proposing to use cast block for the construction of the kiosk as well as on the lower bases of the canopy poles.

- **General:** The applicant shall not need to submit and obtain City of Perrysburg engineering approvals but will be required to review the construction plans with the City of Perrysburg Fire Division prior to a zoning permit being issued. A zoning permit is required prior to Wood County issuing a building permit.

- **Other:** The fuel center elevations indicate the presence of several items that are considered to be “outdoor storage” such as the bagged ice container, pop machines, “pallet cage, and the u-shaped merchandiser. Essential items like a trash can and spill kits are not considered to be outdoor storage. Per Ch. 1225.08 the storage of these items outdoors at the fuel center is not permitted.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator has reviewed all necessary information for the consideration of the preliminary and final site plan and recommends conditional approval of the preliminary and final site plan. The administrator recommends that preliminary and final site plan approval be conditioned upon the resolution of the following items: subject to the fulfillment of the following conditions:

1. Striped parking area to be converted to a raised, curbed island at the location where the 2 parking spaces are being lost. (between SR20 and the fuel center)
2. A tree be planted in the raised, curbed island as described in condition #1 above.

3. Outdoor storage items (identified in the above report) to be removed from plans.
4. Any proposed fire suppression equipment to be screened from view and approved by the Planning and Zoning Administrator.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. Becky Klein of SSOE was present on behalf of the applicant. She said that the Planning and Zoning Administrator's comments and conditions are acceptable to Kroger except for the outside sales. She said that they would like to pursue a variance or special approval use for the outside sales. She distributed handouts to Commission members showing the merchandising bins that Kroger is proposing. She said that screening is provided by the U-shaped modular design.

Ms. Witt asked about the size of the trees. Mr. Walters said that they will be a minimum of 2 ½" caliper. Mayor Olmstead asked what percentage of sales is generated by the outdoor sales. Ms. Klein said that she does not have that information, but she can get it from Kroger. Mr. Forquer asked about the Fire Division doing inspections regarding the fuel. Mr. Walters said that item #4 of the Staff Report he is actually referring to the aesthetics of the fire suppression equipment. There was further discussion regarding the outside sales, but it was noted that the Code does not allow it and there is no avenue to ask for a special approval. Ms. Klein asked that this item be tabled so she can discuss the issue regarding outside sales with Kroger.

Mr. Carry moved to table the Preliminary and Final Site Plan for the Kroger fuel station. Mr. Hudson seconded. Ayes: Carry, Forquer, Hudson, Nicely, Olmstead, and Witt (6). Abstain: Choka (1).

Preliminary & Final Site Plan Approval
Owens-Illinois Propane Storage Tank
2055 North Wilkinson Way (Plaza 5 – Innovation Center)

APPLICANT
Rick Fox
SSOE, Inc.
1001 Madison Ave.
Toledo, OH 43604

OWNER
Veronica Millen
Owens-Illinois, Inc.
One Michael Owens Way, Plaza Four
Perrysburg, OH 43551

REQUEST
Chapter 1260.08 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1260.10 – Final Site Plan Review

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION
Owens Illinois proposes to install a propane storage tank on the south side of the driveway servicing the existing Innovation Center building. The subject property is approximately 4 acres of the larger Owens-Illinois property, which is zoned I-2 "General Industrial" and is located north and west of N. Wilkinson Way.

The site is bordered on the east and south by other industrial/manufacturing uses and is bordered on the west by the CSX rail line. The submitted plans show a propane storage tank that is 6'2" in height (without the pedestal) and 39'7" in length. The total capacity of the tank is 8,000 gallons. Additionally, "connection piping" and a "vaporizer" is shown just to the east of the tank between the tank and N. Wilkinson Way. The applicant proposes to protect this tank and associated piping with seven 10' long precast concrete barriers (standard ODOT Jersey Barrier).

ANALYSIS
The submitted plans for this project have been found to be consistent with the dimensional standards of Chapter 1230 including maximum height and the 60' front yard setback requirement.

Per Chapter 1250 Site Design Standards, the following items were reviewed:

- **Landscaping:** Five additional Norway Spruce trees are proposed to be installed on the south/southwest side of the tank. Landscape notes indicate the trees to be 15 inches on center but likely means 15 feet on center.

- **Signage:** No additional signage is indicated.

- **Lighting:** No lighting is shown on/for the proposed tank.

- **Other:** All other aspects of the site were reviewed and approved by the Planning Commission at previous meetings on July 26, 2012, November 15, 2012, January 31, 2014 and July 31, 2014. All reviewed features appear to remain in compliance with the development standards and as such do not require further review.

- **Construction Review:** Due to the substance and quantity of the fuel being stored construction approval will be required by the City of Perrysburg Fire Department before Zoning Permits will be issued for this project.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Zoning Administrator recommends that the Planning Commission request additional justification concerning the proposed location of the propane storage tank. The plans indicate a perimeter around the building at 75' and it is unknown if these is a regulatory requirement or a reference dimension. It is recommended to require the tank be located behind the rear of the building to a less visible location. If the Planning Commission is convinced the tank cannot be relocated for regulatory, safety, or overwhelming practical reasons, it is suggested to require additional landscape material to better screen the tank from the east, south and west directions. Additionally, the use of portable concrete barriers (jersey barriers) should not be encouraged due to their low height and overall appearance.

Mr. Walters reviewed the above Staff Report. Mr. Choka said that he has to abstain from this issue due to a conflict. Jeff Mraovich of Amerigas and Veronica Millen of O-I were present. Ms. Millen said that the 75' perimeter is an insurance requirement so they would not be able to relocate the tank to the rear of the building. Mr. Hudson asked if they have any objection to the additional landscaping and Ms. Millen said they have no objections. Mr. Forquer asked if there is an existing tank and Ms. Millen said there is not, they currently work from a truck. She said that they will only need the tank for two years and then the Innovation Center will return to natural gas and the tank will be removed. Ms. Millen added that the insurance company is also requiring fencing to prevent human tampering. She said the jersey barriers are to protect the tank from vehicular traffic, although it is 20' off of the surface road. Mr. Forquer said that he is not in favor of the jersey barriers but he is more open to them if it is only for a period of two years. Mr. Carry asked Mr. Walters if his concerns regarding the jersey barriers are lessened if they will be removed in two years. Mr. Walters said that it is less of an issue, however there is no obligation to remove them after the two year period.

Mr. Hudson made a motion to approve the Preliminary and Final Site Plan with the conditions specified by the Planning and Zoning Administrator with the exception of the condition regarding the jersey barriers. There was no second to the motion.

Mr. Forquer made a motion to approve the propane storage tank facility for O-I as submitted with 6' security fencing, landscaping adequate to screen the tank and the installation of jersey barriers to prevent traffic problems, with the facility to be removed in a period not to exceed two years. Mr. Carry seconded. Ayes: Carry, Forquer, Hudson, Nicely, Olmstead, and Witt (6). Abstain: Choka (1).

Preliminary & Final Site Plan Review
Chas. E. Phipps Co.
12450 Williams Rd.

APPLICANT/OWNER/DEVELOPER
Poggemeyer Design Group, Inc.
935 Cleveland Ave.
Defiance, OH 43512

REQUEST
Chapter 1260.05 – Preliminary Site Plan Review
Chapter 1260.08 – Final Site Plan Review
Chapter 1250 – Site Design Standards

PROPERTY LOCATION & DESCRIPTION

Location: On the north side of Williams Road between Columbus Equipment and Penske Truck Rental. This property is located immediately south of Lock-it-Up Self Storage.

Property Size: 2.026 total acres

Parcels: Q61-400-180000042500

BACKGROUND
This property is currently occupied by the Charles Phipps Company.

ANALYSIS
The applicants have provided the necessary documents to conduct a preliminary site plan review only.

Preliminary Site Plan

- **Zoning:** I1 (Light Industrial)
- **Setbacks** (minimums)**:** Front: 60 ft.
  Side (each): 25 ft.
  Rear: 40 ft.
- **Adjacent Zoning/Uses:**
  All adjacent uses are currently zoned I1 (Light Industrial)
- **Land Use(s):** Warehousing (Permitted)
  Retail: less than 60,000 GSF (legal non-conforming use)

- **Site Layout:** The applicant proposes to concrete a remaining portion of a stone driveway and parking lot. A small portion of stone that is not proposed to be concreted is shown to be removed and replaced with topsoil and seeded.

Final Site Plan

- **Parking:** No information has been provided.
- **Landscape Islands:** No information has been provided but this plan does not appear to incorporate any landscape islands into the existing or proposed parking areas.
- **Parking Lot Landscape:** No information has been provided.
- **Site Landscaping:** No information has been provided for onsite landscaping. Street trees have been identified as existing along Williams Road.
- **Signage:** Any request for signage will be reviewed in accordance with Ch. 1250.29 prior to the issuance of any sign permits.
- **Lighting:** No information has been provided.
- **Sidewalks:** Public sidewalks are present across Williams Road frontage.
- **General Engineering:** The applicant shall submit and obtain City of Perrysburg engineering approvals for drainage calculations prior to a zoning permit being issued.

RECOMMENDATION
The Planning and Zoning Administrator has reviewed all provided information and recommends disapproving both the preliminary and final site plan submission.

Dave Thomas, owner of the property and business, was present. He said that the business is wholesale sales and they have six employees, with only four there on a regular basis. Lee Rausch of Poggemeyer Design Group said that there are no changes to the signage and lighting so they did not submit any plans. He said that they do not want to remove pavement for landscape islands because it would be too expensive. He said a landscape island in the area they want to concrete would interfere with traffic. Mr. Hudson asked about drainage. Mr. Rausch said that drainage calculations have been prepared and they will submit them to Engineering, but it shows that the existing drainage is sufficient. There was discussion regarding the Code Requirements. The Code requires a landscape island for every ten spaces. Mr. Walters added that there is a secondary

landscape requirement of 6% of the site. Mr. Rausch said that striping the parking spaces would take them to 13 per the Code. Mr. Walters said that two landscape islands would be required and that would not meet 6% of the site. Mr. Thomas said he does not know where the landscape islands would go. Ms. Witt said that she thinks the four existing trees that are grouped together should qualify as a landscape island and then in the stone area where they plan on putting grass they could put bushes and a tree. Mr. Walters said that he agrees that the four tree area should qualify as a landscape island. Mr. Forquer said that this would be an improvement to the area. Ms. Witt asked what was needed to approve the final site plan. Mr. Walters said that it is up to the Commission members, but there are several unknowns such as the percentage of landscape and the sizes of parking spaces.

Ms. Witt moved to table the Preliminary and Final Site Plan for Chas. E. Phipps Co. Mr. Carry seconded and it was unanimously approved.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Jo Sutton