

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MAY 12, 2014

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chairman Robert Seyfang. Commission members present were: Pam Aubry, Emily Crego, Charles Hablitzel, Alex Heard, Dennis Layman, Ruth Lucius and Robert Seyfang (7). Also present was Brody Walters, Planning and Zoning Administrator.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Ms. Aubry moved to approve the minutes of the April 14, 2014 meeting as written. Mr. Layman seconded and they were unanimously approved.

APPLICATION 07-14 – Jeff Normand on behalf of Liz and Steve Fowler, requests a certificate of appropriateness to demolish an existing residence and construct a new single-family house. Consideration includes color, material and architectural style. The subject property is located at 201 Walnut Street and is zoned OS (Office and Service). Additionally, it is the intent of the applicant to pursue rezoning to a residential land use.

Mr. Walters reviewed Application 7-14. Jeff Normand said that the existing house at 201 Walnut has been a rental for the last ten to fifteen years and it has some issues. It is too low in the lot, the basement is only 5' tall, the foundation is collapsing in a couple of spots, and the second story is only accessible by ships ladder stairs. There is nothing of architectural significance on the interior. Mr. Heard asked if there is anything of architectural significance on the exterior. Mr. Normand said there are a few windows but they don't match. Mr. Heard asked about the size of the new home to be built. Mr. Normand said it will be between 2,500 to 2,800 square feet. There was discussion regarding the building materials, setbacks, porches and roof lines. Mr. Normand said that he will bring the final plans for the house back to the Commission for their consideration. Mr. Walters said that a conceptual plan is being presented at this point.

Mr. Heard moved to approve the demolition of the current residence and the concept of a new single family residence at 201 Walnut Street with the condition that the three windows that were mentioned as having architectural significance be salvaged. Ms. Aubry seconded and it was unanimously approved.

APPLICATION 08-14 – Cheryl Stieben-Palicki requests a certificate of appropriateness to construct a deck to the side of her existing residence. Consideration includes color, material and architectural style. The subject property is located at 114 Pine Street and is zoned R-3 (Single-Family Residential). The applicant must also obtain approval from the Board of Zoning Appeals for setback relief along the side property line.

Mr. Walters reviewed Application 8-14 adding that the Board of Zoning Appeals granted approval of the relief for the side yard setback. Mr. Layman asked if they have talked to the neighbor. Case Christensen, Ms. Stieben-Palicki's son, said that a letter was presented to the Board of Zoning Appeals from the neighbor at 116 Pine Street who has no objections to the project. Mr. Seyfang said his only concern is that it looks too busy. He wondered if the deck would be enough without the screening at the bottom. Ms.

Stieben Palicki said that she feels it needs something at the bottom. There was discussion regarding the railing height. Mr. Christensen said that he will continue the railing height around from the front and include landscaping along the bottom.

Mr. Heard moved to approve Application 8-14 as submitted with the condition that the railing height be maintained, the bottom be screened and landscaping be included. Ms. Aubry seconded and it was unanimously approved.

APPLICATION 09-14 – Tony and Marie Galloro requests a certificate of appropriateness to reside an existing garage and add a gabled roof “patio cover” onto the garage. Consideration includes color, material and architectural style. The subject property is located at 326 E. Front Street is zoned R-3 (Single-Family Residential).

Mr. Walters reviewed Application 9-14. Mr. Galloro said that the garage will match the house, and he will be using the posts from the original house to support the roof for the patio cover. By the service door that leads into the garage he will be adding a gable that extends out 2’ from the existing garage wall. Mr. Layman noted that the columns will be round as opposed to square, but you can’t see both at the same time. Mr. Heard noted that he has the benefit of looking at the Galloro’s home each morning and it is a beautiful addition to the community.

Ms. Aubry moved to approve Application 9-14 as submitted. Mr. Layman seconded and it was unanimously approved.

APPLICATION 10-14 – Kate MacPherson on behalf of Nick and Jennifer Hall, requests a certificate of appropriateness to demolish an existing residence and construct a new single-family house. Consideration includes color, material and architectural style. The subject property is located at 501 E. Second Street and is zoned R-3 (Single-Family Residential).

Mr. Walters reviewed Application 10-14. Ms. MacPherson, architect for Nick and Jennifer Hall, made a presentation to the Commission. She said that the existing house has no architectural significance and is in bad shape. She said that they are proposing a 2,600 square foot house including the garage. They will maintain the existing foundation and first floor framing. There will be an open porch along Hickory Street. The proposed house height relates to the street line and the glass on the east side looking onto the garden relates with the glass at the Carranor Club. The outside of the house will have rain screen with thermally broken aluminum windows, white membrane roof, and a living screen fence would screen the neighbor to the east. Ms. MacPherson said they are looking at different rain screens and a lot of porches in Perrysburg use this material. It will be gray material and a few inches behind that would be a water barrier. There will be solar panels for the flat area of the roof, but they will not be angled. She said they are excited about introducing a sustainable building to the Historic District.

Mr. Seyfang asked what the living screen would look like in the winter. Ms. MacPherson said that it depends on what plants you use, and they could make it conditional that they use something that stays green year round. Mr. Layman asked if the two trees in the

front would be removed. Ms. MacPherson said that those trees would stay but several pines and spruces will come down. Mr. Heard said that he thinks it is exciting, it's different, it is an attractive addition to the community, and it has historic relevance. Ms. Lucius said that the general public does not understand the information presented by Ms. MacPherson. She quoted the guidelines which state: As a property owner in the Historic District you must ensure that all new construction endorses Perrysburg's strong traditions of careful design, complements its environment, and it is sensitive to what's come before it. Ms. Lucius said that she feels that it has been carefully designed and it complements its environment, but she cannot support it because she does not feel it is sensitive to what has come before it. Mr. Layman said that he feels anything built in 2014 should look like 2014 and not 1895. Mr. Heard said that this captures the essence of the 1950's and is based on those concepts and themes. Mr. Seyfang noted that Ottawa Hills has a lot of contemporary houses that fit in there. Ms. Crego stated that she doesn't particularly like the existing house, and although the design is well thought out, she does not think the proposed house fits in either. She said that with regards to sustainability, in graduate school they emphasized that the greenest house is the one that is already built. She said that perhaps there is a way to use the existing structure and make it more appropriate. Ms. MacPherson said that she thinks most would agree that the existing structure is not a significant example of architectural significance to the 1950's. She said that they have looked at ways to use the existing house and she agrees that where there is historic fabric it should be preserved. However, she feels there is precedent for contemporary design. Ms. Aubry said that this Commission has tried to maintain the flavor of Perrysburg and she likes the house, just not on Second Street.

Several people were in attendance and spoke in favor of the project: architect Mike Barthold; Terry Lesniewicz (owner of adjacent property); Molly Thompson, 440 E. Second Street; Rick Avery, 536 E. Front Street; Tricia Darr, Front Street.

Mr. Seyfang moved to approve Application 10-14 as submitted. Mr. Hablitzel seconded and it was approved 4-3. Ayes: Hablitzel, Heard, Layman, Seyfang (4). Nays: Aubry, Crego, Lucius (3).

APPLICATION 11-14 – John Gordon, requests a certificate of appropriateness to alter an existing dumpster enclosure by adding an integrated shed feature. Consideration includes color, material and architectural style. The subject property is located at 133 W. Second Street and is zoned OS (Office & Service).

Mr. Walters reviewed Application 11-14. Mr. Gordon said that it was a rough winter and the snow plow knocked down two walls of the enclosure that was there. He said that he plans to use the existing walls and the concrete posts next to the alley. He will put cedar around the outside of it and it will be the same color as the existing with a rounded top.

Ms. Lucius moved to approve Application 11-14 as submitted. Ms. Crego seconded and it was unanimously approved.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Jo Sutton