

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

NOVEMBER 9, 2015

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chairman Ruth Lucius. Commission members present were Dennis Barrett, Charles Hablitzel, Ruth Lucius, Ted Rogers and Robert Seyfang (5). Alex Heard was absent (1). Also present was Brody Walters, Planning and Zoning Administrator.

Mr. Barrett moved to approve the minutes of the October 12, 2015 meeting as written. Mr. Rogers seconded and they were unanimously approved.

APPLICATION 23-15 – The City of Perrysburg requests to inform the Historic Landmarks Commission of the scheduled demolition of a structure located at 111 Water Street (Water Works Building). ***Informational Only.***

Mr. Walters read the above summary of Application 23-15. Mr. Barrett asked why it is an informational only item. Mr. Walters stated that the Commission was provided with the reports about the structural analysis and the letter from Mike Rudey, the Chief Building Official in Wood County. He said that included in the Code is an exclusion from obtaining a certificate of appropriateness for safety and liability issues. It is being presented for the Commission's information because it is the appropriate and respectful thing to do because the Commission has jurisdiction over the area. Mr. Barrett said that he read all of the reports and he did not get the feeling that it is unsafe right now. Mr. Walters said that in the Code there are three opportunities for demolition; two involve a certificate of appropriateness and one does not. Mr. Rogers asked if anything will be rebuilt on the site. Mr. Walters said there are funds proposed in the budget. Kitty Gibson said that estimates show the repairs would cost \$38,500 and she wanted to know why the City doesn't have to get a Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Walters said that he is there to represent the City but he is not the City's legal representative. The Law Director has advised that this is permitted. Jon Orser, 125 E. Front Street, said that this is absurd and he read Section 1245.55(g) of the Code. Mr. Walters said that the exclusion is in Section 1245.59. Mr. Orser said that this is not an unsafe or dangerous condition; it is a sham. He said the Mayor is going around City Council and the Historic Landmarks Commission and a lawsuit by citizens is possible. Kate MacPherson, W. Second Street, said that Mike Rudey's letter only references two reports, DGL and JDI. She said that they are civil engineers not structural engineers. Mr. Walters said that he was not responsible for transmitting documents to Mike Rudey but it is his understanding that Mr. Rudey received everything. Ms. MacPherson said that Mr. Rudey's letter could have said his recommendation is to tear it down but it doesn't. She said the building is not an architectural beauty; it is a utilitarian structure. It has been a landmark on the river since 1900 and has historical and cultural significance. Ms. MacPherson read a letter from Bob Boyd. She said that half a million dollars to renovate that building is a good deal. The foundation is grandfathered and to throw that away would be reckless. She asked that they reconsider tearing it down because it is an historical landmark. Deborah Born said that she agrees that we need to keep the building. She said the Boat Club should be allowed to buy the building and it can be repaired for \$10,000. Mr. Orser said that price is not to be considered in demolitions.

Gene Phlegar asked if the Commission can express an opinion. Mr. Walters said that they are not being asked to, but they are free to give their opinion.

APPLICATION 24-15 – The City of Perrysburg requests to inform the Historic Landmarks Commission of the scheduled demolition of a structure located at 112 Water Street (residential rental). *Informational Only.*

Mr. Walters read the above summary of Application 24-15. Chip Pflgebraar asked when the City found out about the condition of the property at 112 Water Street. Mr. Walters said that after seeing the condition of the building at 111 Water Street he suggested that all City owned rental units be inspected. Mr. Orser said that everything he said about the earlier case applies to this one also.

Mr. Barrett moved that the Historic Landmarks Commission express for the record an opinion that these two demolitions should be delayed until City Council can continue to review what is the best action to be taken. The motion died for lack of a second.

Mr. Seyfang said that for City Council to make a proper decision they need to know the cost to stabilize and repair the building. Mr. Walters said that the City has been informed by our insurance company that as of December 1st the building will no longer be insured. As far as the cost, he said JDI was the only group to put a number in their report and that was an engineer's estimate of \$466,200. Ms. MacPherson said that it should be sold to the Boat Club. Mr. Walters said that according to the Law Director City property for sale has to be open to competitive sale. Ms. MacPherson said they could do a property swap. Carl Swanson, retiring board member of the Boat Club, said that the membership voted to acquire the building or trade property with the City and the City should consider it.

APPLICATION 25-15 – The City of Perrysburg requests a certificate of appropriateness for the proposed improvements at Riverside Park. The subject property is located north of Front Street, west of Hood Park and is zoned P (Park).

Mr. Walters reviewed Application 25-15. Tim Bockbrader of the Edge Group gave a presentation to the Commission. He stated that the cable rail system is transparent and does not obstruct the view but meets safety requirements. Mr. Walters said that this review is of the layout, scale, features and to introduce materials. Specific colors have not been identified. Mr. Barrett asked if there will be another review once that has been determined. Mr. Walters said if there are no significant changes this will be it as they feel the details are pinned down enough. Ms. Lucius asked why there are so many trees and if they will stabilize the hill. Mr. Bockbrader said that is a natural area and trees help to soften the scale. Ms. Lucius said that she is against any trees along Front Street. Mr. Walters said that the plans call for only four trees along Front Street which are the ones in the greenspace islands. Mr. Bockbrader said that the four trees at the upper plaza will help with scale and to provide shade. He added that they are looking at a large canopy tree that will not obstruct the view. Mr. Barrett asked about the trees at the bottom. Mr. Bockbrader said they will not block the view. Mr. Walters clarified that the Commission is being asked to approve the black and white drawing in their packet. Mr. Barrett said that the sun shades don't look like historic Perrysburg. Mr. Bockbrader said that idea is from nature; they are bird-shaped. Ms. Lucius said she's not sure how many handicapped

people will use the ramp. There was discussion about the Redi-Rock material that will be used for the retaining wall. Ms. Lucius asked if there are any concerns about Indian remains or relics. Mr. Bockbrader said that reports have been done for this area and Mr. Walters added that the intention is to employ someone to be on site during excavation.

Kitty Gibson asked about the grant the City applied for. Mr. Walters said the City did not receive the grant so they are looking at either paring down the project or perhaps phasing. Chip Pflgebraar asked about the sewers. Mr. Walters said that the City is aware of the overflows and are looking at ways to alleviate them. Rachel Wesley, 563 E. Indiana, asked about the grass and who will be mowing it and the effect on the water quality. Mr. Bockbrader said that the majority of the hill will remain no mow but they plan to eliminate the weeds and do a fescue mixture. Ms. Wesley asked about snow being cleared from the steps and ramp and she expressed concern about salt going into the river. Mr. Walters said it is his understanding that the City will clear the ramp. Gene Phlegar expressed concerns about skateboarders. Jon Orser said that this is a modern urban design and does not fit in the Historic District.

Ms. Lucius said that she was at the park late in October and there were a lot of people and she saw a man on a scooter who had no problem getting down the hill at Hood Park. Mr. Walters explained that the ramp is not being installed by preference, the City is required to provide ADA accessibility. Ms. Lucius said that she would like to see the sewer issue resolved first. Mr. Walters stated that the scope of review by this Commission is if this project is worthy of a Certificate of Appropriateness for layout and materials. Mr. Hablitzel said that he likes the design of the park but has concerns about how it fits in the Historic District. He said that he likes the use of block because it matches the bridge abutments.

Kate MacPherson said that she thinks the single ramp is elegant and she feels this is appropriate for the Historic District as designed. She said it preserves the vista and suggested that if possible the path be continued at a less steep ratio to avoid handrails/guardrails.

Mr. Rogers said that he is not particularly comfortable with the sunshades. He said that maintaining the view is important and he applauds them on doing that. He said the ADA is what it is and if there is a way, he'd like the handrails/guardrails to not look so industrial.

Mr. Rogers moved to approve Application 25-15 excluding the sunshades. Mr. Barrett seconded. Ayes: Barrett, Hablitzel, and Rogers (3). Nays: Lucius (1) Abstain: Seyfang (1).

APPLICATION 19-15 – The City of Perrysburg requests a certificate of appropriateness for the construction of a public restroom facility. The subject property, parcel number Q61-000-901212008000, is located on East Second Street, immediately west of 122 E. Second Street, and is zoned C-2 (Central Business).

Mr. Walters said that this application was previously considered by the Commission but there were questions regarding the orientation of the building and the windows. Mr. Walters provided Commission members with a revised site plan showing the orientation

of the building and he said the windows will be aluminum frame, thermally broken commercial windows. He said that another question that has come up is whether the Commission would be open to the possibility of substituting split faced block for some of the brick. He said that the contractor has asked about doing four courses of split faced brick then a transitional piece and then brick. They feel this will be easier to maintain and would be more durable. Mr. Seyfang suggested that they keep it simple and he asked what type of glass will be in the windows. Mr. Walters said it will be frosted glass. Mr. Seyfang asked how frosted it will be. Mr. Walters said enough to avoid privacy concerns. Mr. Barrett asked what color the door will be. Mr. Walters said it has not be determined, but it will be an earth tone color. His recommendation would be black, putty or brown. Ms. Lucius expressed concerns that the restroom is not addressing the needs of today's society because we need a family restroom for single fathers with daughters and for caregivers to help people on scooters. Mr. Walters said that he understands the concerns about a family restroom, but space is limited and the floor plan meets ADA requirements.

Mr. Barrett moved to approve Application 19-15 keeping it all as brick. Mr. Seyfang seconded. Ayes: Barrett, Hablitzel, Rogers and Seyfang (4). Nays: Lucius (1).

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 9:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Jo Sutton